



# National Transportation Safety Board Aviation Accident Final Report

---

<b>Location:</b>	Muskegon, MI	<b>Accident Number:</b>	GAA15CA005
<b>Date &amp; Time:</b>	03/10/2015, 0740 EDT	<b>Registration:</b>	N12155
<b>Aircraft:</b>	CESSNA 208B	<b>Aircraft Damage:</b>	Substantial
<b>Defining Event:</b>	Abrupt maneuver	<b>Injuries:</b>	1 None
<b>Flight Conducted Under:</b>	Part 135: Air Taxi & Commuter - Non-scheduled		

---

## Analysis

The pilot reported that he flew an autopilot coupled approach to minimums in instrument meteorological conditions (IMC). The pilot exited IMC at the decision height, disconnected the autopilot, and the approach lights became visible. The pilot determined he was right of the runway and as he maneuvered to realign the airplane with the runway, he struck elements of the approach light system. A postaccident examination revealed the airplane sustained substantial damage to the horizontal stabilizer.

Effective at the time of this accident was a permanent Notice to Airmen (NOTAM) associated with the ILS runway 24 approach prohibiting a coupled autopilot approach from 1150 feet mean seal level to the surface. During a post-accident interview the pilot stated he was unaware of this NOTAM. The NOTAM had been in effect since February 21st, 2014 and the approach chart used did not note this approach restriction.

Weather at the time of the accident was reported as winds from 250 degrees at 5 knots, 1/2 statute mile visibility, 200 feet overcast, temperature 32 degrees Fahrenheit, dew point 32 degrees Fahrenheit, and altimeter 30.04 inches of mercury.

The pilot reported no preimpact mechanical failures or malfunctions with the airframe or engine that would have precluded normal operation.

## Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: The pilot's improper decision to continue the landing when the airplane was not in a safe position to land, resulting in the collision with ground-based approach lighting.

## Findings

<b>Aircraft</b>	Heading/course - Not attained/maintained (Cause)
<b>Personnel issues</b>	Decision making/judgment - Pilot (Cause) Use of available resources - Pilot
<b>Environmental issues</b>	Runway/taxi/approach light - Contributed to outcome

## Factual Information

### History of Flight

Approach-IFR final approach	Altitude deviation Attempted remediation/recovery Abrupt maneuver (Defining event) Collision with terr/obj (non-CFIT)
Landing-flare/touchdown	Hard landing

### Pilot Information

Certificate:	Flight Instructor; Commercial	Age:	71
Airplane Rating(s):	Multi-engine Land; Single-engine Land; Single-engine Sea	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	Glider	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):	Airplane Multi-engine; Airplane Single-engine; Instrument Airplane	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 2 With Waivers/Limitations	Last Medical Exam:	08/05/2014
Occupational Pilot:	Yes	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	11/07/2014
Flight Time:	(Estimated) 8316 hours (Total, all aircraft), 5350 hours (Total, this make and model), 8020 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 19 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 4 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 2 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

### Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Manufacturer:	CESSNA	Registration:	N12155
Model/Series:	208B	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	No
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	208B0562
Landing Gear Type:	Tricycle	Seats:	2
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	03/03/2015, AAIP	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	8750 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:		Engines:	1 Turbo Prop
Airframe Total Time:	11243 Hours	Engine Manufacturer:	Pratt and Whitney
ELT:	C91A installed, not activated	Engine Model/Series:	PT6A-114A
Registered Owner:	Aero Leasing INC	Rated Power:	675 hp
Operator:	Martinaire Aviation, L.L.C.	Air Carrier Operating Certificate:	On-demand Air Taxi (135)
Operator Does Business As:	Martinaire	Operator Designator Code:	MT9A

## Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Instrument Conditions	Condition of Light:	Night/Dark
Observation Facility, Elevation:	KMKG, 633 ft msl	Observation Time:	0755 EDT
Distance from Accident Site:	0 Nautical Miles	Direction from Accident Site:	257°
Lowest Cloud Condition:		Temperature/Dew Point:	1° C / 1° C
Lowest Ceiling:	Obscured / 200 ft agl	Visibility	0.5 Miles
Wind Speed/Gusts, Direction:	5 knots, 210°	Visibility (RVR):	3500 ft
Altimeter Setting:	30.04 inches Hg	Visibility (RVV):	
Precipitation and Obscuration:	Heavy - Shallow - Fog; No Precipitation		
Departure Point:	Lansing, MI (KLAN)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	IFR
Destination:	Muskegon, MI (KMKG)	Type of Clearance:	IFR
Departure Time:	0652 EDT	Type of Airspace:	Class D

## Airport Information

Airport:	Muskegon County Airport (KMKG)	Runway Surface Type:	Asphalt
Airport Elevation:	629 ft	Runway Surface Condition:	Dry
Runway Used:	24	IFR Approach:	ILS
Runway Length/Width:	6501 ft / 150 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	Full Stop

## Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 None	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	1 None	Latitude, Longitude:	43.172500, -86.228333 (est)

## Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Bradley M Bigelow	Adopted Date:	09/11/2015
Additional Participating Persons:	Thomas G Kozura; Federal Aviation Administration; Grand Rapids, MI		
Publish Date:	09/11/2015		
Note:	This accident report documents the factual circumstances of this accident as described to the NTSB.		
Investigation Docket:	<a href="http://dms.nts.gov/pubdms/search/dockList.cfm?mKey=90855">http://dms.nts.gov/pubdms/search/dockList.cfm?mKey=90855</a>		

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB), established in 1967, is an independent federal agency mandated by Congress through the Independent Safety Board Act of 1974 to investigate transportation accidents, determine the probable causes of the accidents, issue safety recommendations, study transportation safety issues, and evaluate the safety effectiveness of government agencies involved in transportation. The NTSB makes public its actions and decisions through accident reports, safety studies, special investigation reports, safety recommendations, and statistical reviews.

The Independent Safety Board Act, as codified at 49 U.S.C. Section 1154(b), precludes the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an incident or accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report.